

A GENERALIZATION OF ONE ERDÖS'S PROBLEM

Stephan Danchev¹, Krassimir Atanassov^{1,2}

¹*Centre for Biomedical Engineering - Bulg. Academy of Sci. Acad. G. Bonchev str., Bl. 105, Sofia-1113, Bulgaria e-mail: krat@bgcict.bitnet*

²*Math. Res. Lab., P.O.Box 12, Sofia-1113, Bulgaria e-mail: krat@bgcict.bitnet*

In memory of
Prof. Paul Erdős

The world-famous Hungarian mathematician Paul Erdős formulated in the Bulgarian newspaper "Mathematical Post" No. 11/June 1993 the following problem: let the natural numbers a_1, a_2, \dots, a_{n+1} satisfy the inequalities:

$$1 \leq a_1 \leq a_2 \leq \dots \leq a_{n+1} \leq 2.n.$$

Prove that there exist two numbers among them such that one of them divides the other.

We shall formulate a generalization of the above Erdős's problem.

Let a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n are integers in the interval $[1, m]$, where $2.\lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil \geq n > \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$. The following assertion is valid.

THEOREM 1: There exist at least $n - \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$ pairs unordered and without reiteration) of these numbers, such that one of the numbers divides the other and this estimation is exact.

Proof: For two fixed natural numbers m and n , let S_2 denote the number of the pairs which satisfy the condition that the result of the division is a power of 2. We shall prove that $S_2 \geq n - \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$. Let

$$A_p = \{a_i \mid a_i = 2^q.(2p - 1), 1 \leq i \leq n, p, q \in \mathcal{N}\}$$

be a multiset, where \mathcal{N} is the set of the natural numbers, $1 \leq p \leq \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$. Obviously,

$$S_2 = \sum_{p=1}^{\lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil} \binom{\overline{A}_p}{2},$$

where \overline{X} is the cardinality of the set X .

We shall prove that the minimum of S_2 is obtained for some A_p , ($1 \leq p \leq \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$) that satisfy $|\overline{A}_s - \overline{A}_r| \leq 1$, for all s and r such that $1 \leq s < r \leq \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$.

Let us assume the opposite, i.e., that there exist s and r for which $\overline{A}_s - \overline{A}_r > 1$.

Let us transfer one element of the set A_s to the set A_r . Therefore, we obtain the new sets A'_s and A'_r and the new number

$$S'_2 = \sum_{p=1}^{\lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil} \binom{\overline{A}'_p}{2}.$$

Then

$$S'_2 - S_2 = \binom{\bar{A}_s - 1}{2} + \binom{\bar{A}_r + 1}{2} - \binom{\bar{A}_s}{2} - \binom{\bar{A}_r}{2} = \bar{A}_r - \bar{A}_s + 1 < 0,$$

which is a contradiction with our assumption of the minimality of S_2 .

When $2 \cdot \lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor \geq n > \lceil \frac{m}{2} \rceil$ it is easily seen that the minimal value of S_2 is obtained for $\bar{A}_p = 2$ for $n - \lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$ different values of p and $\bar{A}_p = 1$ for the rest values of p . This minimum is equal to $n - \lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$. The lower estimation is exact, which follows from the existence of the multiset $\{m, m-1, \dots, m - (\lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor - 1), m, m-1, \dots, m - (n - \lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor - 1)\}$. In this multiset the pairs for which one number divides the other are exactly $n - \lfloor \frac{m}{2} \rfloor$. \diamond

Let a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n be independently chosen by an uniform discrete distribution in the interval $[1, m]$. We shall prove the following assertion.

THEOREM 2: The mean value of the number of the pairs (unordered and without reiterations) of these numbers, such that one of them is a divisor of the other, is $\binom{n}{2} \frac{2 \ln m + O(1)}{m}$.

PROOF: Let P be the probability that from two arbitrary numbers in the interval $[1, m]$ one of them divides the other; let the mean value be $E(n)$. Because the n -th number is chosen independently from the first $n-1$ numbers, then:

$$E(n) = E(n-1) + (n-1) \cdot P$$

From $E(2) = P$ it follows that $E(n) = \binom{n}{2} \cdot P$.

Let a and b be the chosen numbers. Then P is equal to

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{|\{(a, b) : 1 \leq a = b \leq m\}| + |\{(a, b) : a|b, 1 \leq a < b \leq m\}| + |\{(a, b) : b|a, 1 \leq b < a \leq m\}|}{m^2} = \\ & = \frac{m + \sum_{a=1}^{m-1} (\lfloor \frac{m}{a} \rfloor - 1) + \sum_{b=1}^{m-1} (\lfloor \frac{m}{b} \rfloor - 1)}{m^2} = \frac{2 \sum_{k=1}^m \lfloor \frac{m}{k} \rfloor - m}{m^2}. \end{aligned}$$

From

$$\sum_{k=1}^m \frac{m}{k} \geq \sum_{k=1}^m \lfloor \frac{m}{k} \rfloor \geq \sum_{k=1}^m (\frac{m}{k} - 1) = \sum_{k=1}^m \frac{m}{k} - m$$

and

$$\sum_{k=1}^m \frac{1}{k} = \ln m + O(1)$$

it follows that

$$\sum_{k=1}^m \lfloor \frac{m}{k} \rfloor = m \ln m + O(m).$$

Then $P = \frac{2 \ln m + O(1)}{m}$ and $E(n) = \binom{n}{2} \frac{2 \ln m + O(1)}{m}$. \diamond